



HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION INDICATOR FRAMEWORK

Key indicators to monitor and assess the
implementation of human rights education
and training

HRE 2020 is a global civil society coalition founded by Amnesty International, Human Rights Education Associates (HREA) and Soka Gakkai International (SGI) with the aim of promoting the right to human rights education internationally through advocacy, awareness raising, capacity building and resource development. HRE 2020 was launched on 19 December 2013, marking the second anniversary of the adoption of the Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training by the United Nations General Assembly. HRE 2020 is comprised of 14 like-minded international, regional and national member organizations from all regions of the world with hundreds of individuals who support the mission of the coalition.

For more information <http://www.hre2020.org>

First published in 2015 by HRE 2020

HRE 2020 welcomes suggestions, contributions and information on how this publication is used.

Please contact us at hre2020@hre2020.org

©HRE 2020

All rights reserved. This publication is copyright, but may be reproduced by any method without fee for advocacy, campaigning and educational purposes, but not for resale. The copyright holders request that all such use be registered with them for impact assessment purposes. For copying in any other circumstances, or for reuse in other publications, or for translation or adaptation, prior written permission must be obtained from the publishers, and a fee may be payable. To request permission, or for any other inquiries, please contact hre2020@hre2020.org

Acknowledgements

HRE 2020 is indebted to all those who dedicated their time and expertise to developing this resource:

Felisa Tibbitts, who drafted and compiled this material with the support of the HRE 2020 Coordination Group, namely Sneh Aurora, Iain Byrne and Matteo Tracchi from Amnesty International; Frank Elbers, Sophie Feintuch and Adele Poskitt from HREA; and Kazunari Fujii from Soka Gakkai International.

Members and supporters of the HRE 2020 Global Coalition who contributed to the conceptualization and development of this material with invaluable input and feedback.

HRE USA, who piloted the Indicator Framework in preparation of the first national civil society report on human rights education in the USA submitted to the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights under the 22nd session of the UN's Universal Periodic Review in September 2014.

Design: Chanchan Liu

CONTENTS

Introduction	1
Human rights education and training in national planning	4
Human rights education and training in the formal education sector	6
Human rights education and training for law enforcement and military personnel	15
Human rights education and training for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professionals	23

INTRODUCTION

What is the purpose of this Human Rights Education Indicator Framework?

This resource is a suggested framework of indicators, or measurements, to examine the presence and quality of human rights education policies and practices. It is a tool to support civil society organizations, national human rights institutions and government bodies, as well as United Nations mechanisms (treaty bodies, human rights committees and special procedures) to monitor the implementation of human rights education. The framework aims to support a review of the status of human rights education within national planning, the formal education sector, and the training of professional groups. It is a means of understanding the scale and quality of such practices and identifying gaps and areas for improvement.

What are the relevant international standards on human rights education and training?

There is an increasing body of international human rights law and standards on human rights education and a growing consensus within the international community about the fundamental role of human rights education in the realization of all human rights. International frameworks and standards promote and encourage the development of sustainable national strategies and programmes in human rights education and training and highlight a consensus that human rights education is important to the full and equal enjoyment of all human rights.

The right to a public education that promotes human rights, fundamental freedoms and respect for the content of specific treaties can be found in multiple international conventions and covenants. These include the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Article 13), the Convention on the Rights of the Child (Article 29 and the first set of General Recommendations issued by the Committee on the Rights of the Child), the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (Article 10), the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Article 7), the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Article 65) and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (Article 8)¹, as well as regional instruments such as the European Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education.

The concept and importance of human rights education is now firmly established. The United Nations (UN) Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training and the World Programme for Human Rights Education and its accompanying Plans of Action are guiding documents that set out standards for human rights education to encompass principles of peace, non-discrimination, equality, justice and respect for human dignity. States must ensure the implementation of human rights education provisions enshrined in these international human rights instruments and should be held accountable for their commitments.

States must ensure the implementation of human rights education provisions enshrined in these international human rights instruments, and should be held accountable for their commitments. These normative standards and mechanisms for influence are only as strong as the vigor and quality with which they are implemented and monitored.

Why should we monitor human rights education?

Monitoring the implementation of human rights education and training is fundamental to understand if and how governments are meeting their obligations and commitments as enshrined in international frameworks and standards. Systematic monitoring ensures that such commitments do not just remain on paper, but are effectively translated into action and practice.

Review and monitoring at the national level will in many cases be the most important way to ensure that the state is meeting its obligations. At the international level, UN mechanisms review state implementation of human rights education. For example a review of human rights education should be included in state reports to treaty bodies. Additionally, other review mechanisms such as the Universal Periodic Review (UPR) process and the work of the Special Procedures mandate holders (e.g., Special Rapporteurs) also contribute to the promotion of and ensured implementation of human rights education. The international review processes can mutually reinforce the national level initiatives.

¹The Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, the most recent international human rights treaty to enter into force, has a highly developed section on human rights education, calling for public awareness-raising campaigns and the fostering of respect for the rights of persons with disabilities at all levels of the education system.

Civil society organizations can play a key role in monitoring, ensuring that it is comprehensive, accurate and inclusive.

A consultative review process, which involves the participation of different relevant stakeholders with various backgrounds and expertise (including for example, non-governmental organizations and national human rights institutions), not only facilitates the collection of detailed data and information, but also ensures reliability of information.

A consultative review process can serve multiple aims.

First, the review can help shape recommendations to governments for improving their human rights education programming. These recommendations can be quite specific and become the basis of advocacy efforts by civil society in the intervening years between treaty body and UPR reports.

Second, the review process can be an educational opportunity. It can help to inform those who are less familiar with human rights education about its aim and forms. Human rights educators who participate in these reviews will come to know the treaty body mechanisms of the UN and engage in such processes at the grassroots level.

Finally, such a process can provide baseline data that can be built upon and compared against in subsequent data collection efforts. Indicators are designed precisely for this purpose.

What is the structure of this resource?

Consistent with the standards outlined in the UN Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training and the guidelines provided by the World Programme for Human Rights Education, this indicator framework contains key questions related to the presence, scale and quality of human rights education within a range of sectors.

This resource is divided into the following sections:

- Human Rights Education and Training in National Planning
- Human Rights Education and Training in the Formal Education Sector
- Human Rights Education and Training for Law Enforcement and Military Personnel
- Human Rights Education and Training for Civil Servants, Health Workers, Social Workers, Journalists and Other Professionals

How should this resource be used?

This indicator framework is intended to be an inspiration and guide for the review of human rights education within a range of policies and practices. Only some portions of the framework may be relevant for a particular context. For example a human rights education review may be carried out only for the formal education sector or for a specific audience, such as journalists. Sections of the framework that are relevant to key sectors can be downloaded individually on the HRE 2020 website: www.hre2020.org.

Using the Indicator Framework Tables

The framework is intended to provide a holistic rendering of a range of categories of investigation that can be explored through the review of documents, interviews, surveys and other forms of data collection. The tables that follow include key monitoring indicators and suggested descriptors/sub-indicators across all relevant categories or sectors. These can be directly converted into questions and used in surveys and interviews. Ideally they will be adapted for use in other questionnaires or data collection processes, as the local context requires. This adaptation may have to do with specific human rights education questions for the environment – such as the availability of human rights education materials in local languages – as well as the specific ways in which data collection will be carried out. Questions can be designed with yes/no answers, multiple choice options, numerical data or open-ended replies.

For example, in Section I, the first key indicator under Domain 1 reads:

Has a national focal point and/or body (council, committee, commission, or work group) been established to develop and implement a plan for human rights education?

This question can be answered with a “yes” or a “no”.

The associated sub-indicators ask for additional detail. The sub-indicator, “the focal point is part of the government,” could elicit both a “yes” and also details on the department or office in which the focal point is located. Another sub-indicator, “activities it has performed,” could elicit quantitative data (the number of activities that have taken place annually over a period of the last three years, perhaps grouped according to type of activity and the number of persons involved directly in each activity) as well as qualitative data (a focus on human rights education planning, implementation, etc.).

Systematic Collection of Data

Local actors are in the best position to decide which indicators to use and how to collect information. It is most important that the data be collected in a way that is systematic and inclusive and brings in the required information. It may be wise to review other human rights education monitoring reports that have been developed in deciding which kinds of information to collect and how.

Examples of human rights education-related surveys that have already been used to collect monitoring information can be found on the HRE 2020 website as additional resources. In addition to using surveys, human rights education monitoring can take place through the review of documents, such as government policies and courses in teacher training institutions, interviews and observations. Decisions on which approach to take may depend on not only methodological preferences but also the availability of human and technical resources required for data collection and analysis.

What happens after a monitoring report has been prepared?

Monitoring reports developed through a consultative review process or otherwise can be submitted as stakeholder reports to the relevant treaty and UPR bodies, and to government bodies who are preparing their own state reports.

The monitoring of human rights education policies and practices is just beginning to be carried out and will undoubtedly improve in the coming years.

Contact us

HRE 2020 has prepared this resource to support national monitoring efforts and is available to offer further advice and support is using this Human Rights Education Indicator Framework.

Please also contact us to share your experiences in using this framework and in conducting consultative review processes to monitor the implementation of human rights education at national level.

We aim to share good practices with others in the global human rights education community.

Email hre2020@hre2020.org

Website www.hre2020.org

HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN NATIONAL PLANNING

In this section, we provide a framework to document government commitment to establish and implement a comprehensive and coordinated effort for human rights education and training. This might involve the establishment of a coordinating body, a review of the status of human rights education and the elaboration of a national plan including ways to review its implementation².

Domain 1: Development of a National Human Rights Education and Training Plan

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators ³	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators ⁴	Sources of Information
Has a national focal point and/or body (council, committee, commission, or working group) been established to develop and implement a plan for human rights education? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The focal point and/or implementation body is a part of the government/independent The government manages and financially supports this focal and/or implementation body When established and operational Mandate and functions Membership Activities it has performed (meetings, workshops, etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Information about a human rights education-related focal point and/or body (or a human rights-related entity eligible to incorporate human rights education and training) might be found with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs as well as other ministries or departments related to the content of the work (e.g., Ministry of Education, Ministry of Justice). A multi-sector effort might involve the Prime Minister's office or another central executive-level office. References would include the policy or regulation establishing the focal point or body; minutes of meetings; press releases; reports issued by the entity; and media coverage.
Has a study been carried out on the status of human rights education in the country? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One or more studies were performed on the state of human rights education The study is of high quality and sufficient for the formulation of the plan The process for conducting the study was independent and objective Existing studies on the state of human rights education were taken into consideration The committee requested technical assistance for preparing the plan (consultancies, expert meetings, etc.) from international or national organizations 	
Have priorities for a National Human Rights Education Plan been set? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Priorities have been set on particular human rights, and these human rights are national priorities Priorities have been set on the rights of particular social groups or individuals, including those who are excluded, vulnerable or marginalized Priorities have been set on the educational levels which human rights education will be incorporated Priorities have been set for trainings of professional groups in which human rights education will be incorporated Priorities have been set for non-formal human rights education and training Priorities have been set for public awareness raising 	
Has the National Human Rights Education Plan been completed? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Activities performed to develop the plan Current state of preparation of the plan Actions pending to complete the preparation of the Plan 	

²The World Programme for Human Rights Education calls for each state to establish a focal point for human rights education and to develop a National Plan of Action for human rights education in consultation with stakeholders. (Note that National Plans of Action for human rights, children's rights and other human rights-specific target groups or themes should also contain a human rights education and training component and are eligible to be reviewed and referenced in monitoring human rights education and training.)

³These monitoring questions/indicators can be adapted for human rights education and training within other national human rights-related plans.

⁴This column contains sub-indicators to further explore the key monitoring questions. Local actors may find it useful to develop questions based on these indicators.

Domain 2: Contents of the Plan

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Does the plan include the following information?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The focal point and/or implementation body is a part of the government/independent The government manages and financially supports this focal and/or implementation body When established and operational Mandate and functions Membership Activities it has performed (meetings, workshops, etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Plan itself.
<p>Does the plan reflect all of the priorities established at the planning stage? If not, why not?</p> <p>Describe. Such priorities might include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The target groups (e.g. those who will receive human rights education and training) General human rights content or thematic areas (e.g., non-discrimination) The rights of particular social groups or individuals (e.g., persons with disabilities, indigenous persons, sexual minorities, refugees and asylum seekers) 	
<p>Does the plan contain cross-cutting values not reflected in the indicator above? Describe.</p> <p>Some examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Non-discrimination Gender equality Recognition of ethnic, religious and cultural diversity Fundamental freedoms and peace Rule of law and good governance 	

Domain 3: Implementation of the Plan

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Is the plan being implemented according to schedule? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> An institutional structure in place to oversee and support the implementation of the plan The budget allocated for implementation is being used State bodies and other partners involved in implementation monitor their activities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> If an institutional structure is in place (central, regional and/or local), status reports may be available. Individual government agencies and partner organizations should be integrating human rights education and training within relevant policy, curriculum and training reports.
<p>What is the status of overall implementation? Describe.</p>	<p>Reports and other documentation are available on the status of implementation</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Parliamentary committees may be monitoring and reporting on implementation of human rights education. Any other reports submitted to international and/or regional bodies.

HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN THE FORMAL EDUCATION SECTOR

In this section, we provide a framework to establish evidence of human rights education in the curricula of schools and associated supports such as teaching and learning materials and methodologies, learner assessments, educator preparation and program monitoring and evaluation for ongoing strengthening and improvement⁵.

Domain 1: Human Rights Education in Legislation and Policy Documents

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Do any national laws or policies establish and prescribe human rights education within the formal education system? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy, peace, fundamental freedoms, etc. but 'human rights' should still be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> References to learning about the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other international human rights standards References to the importance of students and teachers being familiar with their rights References to human rights being one of the purposes of education References to the purposes of education and human rights values, such as equality, non-discrimination, inclusion, accountability and participation in society 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legislation - primary and secondary (including national constitution, laws on basic/general education) Ministry of Education white papers, executive orders, rulings or other regulatory instruments
<p>Are there specific departments or units within the Ministry of Education or related institutions specializing in human rights education? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Separate unit for human rights education (possibly combined with citizenship, peace or intercultural education) Human rights education integrated into an existing unit or department, such as the social sciences unit within secondary level education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy papers, memos and organizational charts of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
<p>Have priorities for a National Human Rights Education Plan been set? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Activities performed Time frame for the program Assignment of responsible person to oversee and guide the program Educational personnel and partners involved Allocated budget 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy papers of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) Human rights education program reports

⁵Phase one of the World Programme for Human Rights Education focuses on human rights education in the primary and secondary school systems, and phase two draws attention to human rights education for higher education and on human rights training for teachers and educators. The term "formal education sector" encompasses all of these areas (primary and secondary school systems, higher education institutions and training for teachers and educators.)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Has a policy analysis been carried out to see if human rights education-related outcomes are present within the national goals and outcomes for the schooling system? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its goals, pedagogy and content within the schooling system? (Y/N)</p>	<p>Sample core human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes learner outcomes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • References to knowledge about human rights, such as about one's own rights, the rights of others, key human rights standards and mechanisms and the history of human rights • References to attitudes that reflect human rights values such as equality, non-discrimination, inclusion, participation in society, respect and compassion for others (especially those most vulnerable and marginalized) and justice. • References to skills that enable the promotion of human rights, such as the ability to analyze one's environment using a human rights perspective and to work collectively with others to address problems <p>Sample supportive human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes (also shared with other educational approaches):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • References to intellectual skills that are foundational for human rights promotion, such as critical thinking, multiperspectivity and recognition of bias and stereotypes • References to human relations skills reflective of human rights, such as constructive dialogue 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Legislation – primary and secondary (including law on basic/general education) • Documents identifying learner outcomes (e.g., “responsible citizens”) • Documents identifying the values and principles underpinning curriculum and learning (e.g., student-centered learning, human dignity) • Policies regarding languages of instruction

Domain 2: Human Rights Education in the Curriculum

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Do any national policies establish and prescribe human rights education within the curriculum? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy, peace, fundamental freedoms, etc. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policy references to learner outcomes reflecting human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes at key stages of education (e.g., primary/basic education, lower secondary and secondary) • Reference is made to number of hours per week/month • Reference is made to human rights education as a dedicated subject within the curriculum, part of a broader citizenship course, or mainstreamed in existing learning areas/subjects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum Framework of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Has a study been carried out to determine the presence of human rights education-related learner outcomes and learner-centered teaching methodologies within existing learning areas/subjects and quality standards? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its content and pedagogy within the curriculum? (Y/N)</p>	<p>Sample core and supportive human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes learner outcomes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • References to knowledge about human rights, such as about one’s own rights, the rights of others, key human rights standards and mechanisms and the history of human rights • References to attitudes that reflect human rights values such as equality, non-discrimination, inclusion, participation in society, respect and compassion for others (especially those most vulnerable and marginalized) and justice • References to skills that enable the promotion of human rights, such as the ability to analyze one’s environment using a human rights perspective and to work collectively with others to address problems <p>Sample human rights education learner-centered teaching methodologies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participatory methods of instruction • Open discussion • Cooperative learning • Interactive problem solving • Instruction and learning processes that are inclusive of all students, especially the most vulnerable and marginalized • Student choices that influence instruction and learning processes • Presentations from representatives of vulnerable and marginalized groups and human rights experts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum mapping study • Relevant reports and plans of • Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
<p>Has a strategy for integrating human rights education within the curriculum been developed within existing learning areas/subjects and quality standards? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposed integration of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies within existing learning areas/subjects • Proposed integration of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies across different subjects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum strategy or related planning document • Curriculum strategy report • Curriculum requirements for learning areas/subject • Program monitoring and evaluation data kept by schools and the Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) • Schools inspectorate reports • Research studies on implemented curriculum

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Has a curriculum strategy been implemented to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within existing learning areas/subjects and quality standards? (Y/N) Describe.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Integration of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies into existing learning areas/subjects • Integration of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies across different subjects • Time allotted • Estimated percentage of students participating in human rights education 	

Domain 3: Human Rights Education in Training Materials and Methodologies

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Do any guidelines exist for including human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy in the preparation of textbooks and other learning materials? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its content and methodologies within such guidelines? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy, peace, fundamental freedoms, etc. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • General guidelines for the incorporation of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy in a transversal manner across a range of subjects • Specific suggestions about how to incorporate human rights education into designated existing learning areas/subjects • Content of guidelines is sufficiently clear, accessible and reflects best practice • (See Domains 1 and 2 for examples of indicators for human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guidelines issued by relevant unit of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
Has a textbook review been carried out to determine the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as learner-centered teaching methodologies within existing learning materials? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Textbook review • (See Domains 1 and 2 for examples of indicators for human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies.) • Textbook review is of high quality (sufficient, rigorous and independent) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Textbook review report issued by relevant unit of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Have textbooks been removed, revised or newly developed to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within training programs for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p> <p>Have textbooks been removed, revised or newly developed to weaken the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within training programs for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Textbooks removed • Textbooks revised, and revisions are of high quality • Textbooks newly developed, and new textbooks are of high quality • Removal, revision, or development of textbooks does not weaken the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports from relevant units of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Domain 4: Learner Assessments and Program Evaluations in Human Rights Education

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Are students assessed for achievements in human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Student performance related to human rights education is assessed and graded as part of their performance in existing learning areas/subjects • Assessment is of high quality (sufficient, rigorous and independent), leading to better understanding and appreciation • Students performance related to human rights education is informally assessed (but not graded) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assessment requirements or suggestions associated with human rights education and related subjects • Instruments and methods used at the school/classroom level • Assessment results at school and, if relevant, national level (and regional/local levels, where appropriate) • Schools inspectorate reports
<p>Are teachers assessed for their human rights education practices and methodologies? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Required by Ministry • Determined at school level (optional or required) • Teacher human rights education assessment takes place • Assessment is of high quality leading to better understanding and appreciation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assessment requirements or suggestions associated with teacher performance of human rights education • Instruments and methods used at the school/classroom level • Assessment results at school and, if relevant, national level (and regional/local levels, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Does monitoring take place in relation to the implementation of human rights education at the school/classroom level? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Headmasters, principals and/or department heads keep track of human rights education lesson plans as part of their regular oversight of subjects related to human rights education • School-level data on human rights education is submitted to relevant educational authorities at the district and/or national level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policies and reporting methods for teaching oversight carried out at the school level • Reports from schools • Schools inspectorate reports
Does monitoring take place in relation to the quality of human rights education at the school/classroom level? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Headmasters, principals and/or department heads keep track of human rights education lesson methodologies and student outcomes as part of their regular oversight of subjects related to human rights education • School-level data on human rights education is submitted to relevant educational authorities at the district and/or national level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policies and reporting methods for teaching oversight carried out at the school level • Reports from schools • Schools inspectorate reports
If there is a special government program on human rights education, is it being monitored and evaluated? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formative evaluation of key program components • Summative evaluation • Impact assessment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitoring/status reports • Evaluation reports • Parliamentary Committee reports • Research

Domain 5: Human Rights Education in Non-formal/Extracurricular School-Level Programming

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Do any guidelines encourage school-wide activities that promote human rights education?	<p>Examples of school-wide activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Human rights awareness days • Guest speakers on human rights-related topics • Fundraising activities for a human rights/ humanitarian cause 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guidelines issued by relevant unit of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
Have school wide strategies that promote human rights education been implemented? (Y/N) Describe.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports from relevant units of Ministry of Education (and regional/ local authorities, where appropriate) • Reports from schools • Reports from partner civil society organizations

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Do any guidelines encourage non-formal or extracurricular activities in schools (such as clubs) that promote human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes? (Y/N)	<p>Examples of non-formal/extracurricular school activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Human rights clubs • Model United Nations • Clubs promoting rights-based humanitarian and development actions • Field trips promoting human rights understanding and action • Out-reach to community • Links between students in different countries 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guidelines issued by relevant unit of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
Have non-formal or extracurricular activities that promote human education been implemented? (Y/N) Describe.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports from relevant units of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) • Reports from schools • Reports from partner civil society organizations
Do any guidelines encourage school-wide practices that reflect human rights values (e.g., participation in governance, engagement with families and community members)?	<p>Examples of school-wide practices that reflect human rights values:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful student participation in school decision-making • Respectful and strong relationships between the school and wider community members • Transparency and representativeness in governance • Discipline policies that treat students with respect • Strong links between administrators/teachers with family and community members • Opportunities for students and other members of the school community to organize 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guidelines issued by relevant unit of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
Have school-wide practices that reflect human rights values been implemented? (Y/N) Describe.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports from relevant units of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) • Reports from schools • Reports from partner civil society organizations

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Are there any guidelines that encourage schools to collaborate with civil society organizations in carrying out non-formal or extracurricular human rights education-related activities? (Y/N)	<p>Examples of civil society organizations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National or local human rights organizations • National or local organizations engaged in themes of peace, development and democracy • Community-based organizations • Youth groups engaging in human rights themes • Faith-based groups engaging in human rights themes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guidelines issued by relevant unit of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
Are schools collaborating with civil society organizations in carrying out non-formal or extracurricular human rights education-related activities? (Y/N) Describe.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports from relevant units of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) • Reports from schools • Reports from partner civil society organizations

Domain 6: Human Rights Education in Teacher Training

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Does any national law, policy or education plan require educators to be prepared in human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes as well as learner-centered teaching methodologies? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy, peace, fundamental freedoms, etc. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	(See earlier descriptors for national laws and policies.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Legislation on general/basic education with chapter or section on teacher education and training • Guidelines on acquiring skills and knowledge for human rights teaching
Are there specific departments or units within the Ministry of Education (or within regional or local authorities if relevant) that address educator training and human rights education? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Separate unit for training educators in human rights education (possibly combined with citizenship, peace or intercultural education) • Human rights education integrated within an existing unit or department, such as the social sciences unit within secondary level education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policy papers, memos and organizational charts of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Has the Ministry of Education prepared guidelines for educators in human rights education? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for teacher training institutions on how to prepare teachers in human rights education Guidelines prepared for teachers (directly) on how to carry out human rights education Content of guidelines is sufficiently clear, accessible and reflects best practice 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines issued by relevant unit of Ministry of Education (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
Are human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy present in the curricula of teacher training schools (initial education)? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes Content on human rights education pedagogy Required or optional Time allotted Number of years offered Number of participants and estimated percentage of prospective teachers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum programs Course syllabi Research papers, theses and essays produced by faculty and students on human rights education
Are human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy present in the curricula of higher education (university-based) teacher training institutions (initial education)? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes Content on human rights education pedagogy Required or optional Time allotted Number of years offered Number of participants and estimated percentage of prospective teachers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum programs Course syllabi Research papers, theses and essays produced by faculty and students on human rights education
Are human rights-related courses, trainings, workshops or other activities for practicing teachers provided by the Ministry of Education? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes Content on human rights education pedagogy Required or optional Time allotted Number of years offered Number of participants and estimated percentage of practicing teachers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum programs Course syllabi Training agendas
Are human rights-related courses, trainings, workshops or other activities for practicing teachers provided by national human rights institutions? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes Content on human rights education pedagogy Required or optional Time allotted Number of years offered Number of participants and estimated percentage of prospective teachers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum programs Course syllabi Training agendas

HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION AND TRAINING FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT AND MILITARY PERSONNEL

In this section, we provide a framework to establish evidence of human rights education and training in the curricula of training institutions for law enforcement and military personnel and associated supports such as training materials and methodologies, learner assessments, trainer preparation and program monitoring and evaluation for ongoing strengthening and improvement⁶.

Domain 1: Human Rights Education and Training in Legislation and Policy Documents

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Do any national laws or policies prescribe human rights education within training institutions for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy; protection of life, liberty and property; protection of constitutional guarantees; freedom from torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment; freedom of expression, association and peaceful demonstration, etc.,. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> References to learning about international and regional human rights standards, norms and values, and international humanitarian law (IHL) and their relationship References to relevant codes of conduct, principles, standards and rules References to the importance of personnel being familiar with their rights and those of community members References to the discharging of law enforcement/ military obligations without committing human rights violations References to human rights values such as equality, non-discrimination and service to community members in defining the purposes of law enforcement and military operations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legislation - primary and secondary (including national constitution) White papers, executive orders, rulings or other regulatory instruments of ministries responsible for law enforcement and military personnel
<p>Are there specific departments or units within the relevant ministries specializing in human rights education and training for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Separate unit for human rights education (possibly combined with non-discrimination, diversity and /or gender sensitivity) Human rights education integrated within an existing unit or department 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy papers, memos and organizational charts of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
<p>Is there a specialized government program for human rights education and training for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Activities (to be) performed Time frame for the program Assignment of responsible person to oversee and guide the program Training personnel and partners who will be involved Allocated budget 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ministerial policy papers Human rights education program reports

⁶The second phase of the World Programme for Human Rights Education focuses on human rights education for higher education and on human rights training for teachers and educators, civil servants, law enforcement officials and military personnel.

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Has a policy analysis been carried out to see if human rights education-related outcomes are present within the goals and outcomes of the training of law enforcement and military personnel? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its goals, pedagogy and content within the training system(s)? (Y/N)</p>	<p>Sample core human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reference to the “positive” and “negative” obligations of the state and its agents to respect, protect and fulfill human rights • The status of ratification of international and regional human rights treaties • The duties of law enforcement and military personnel as defined in relevant codes of conduct, principles, standards and rules and their relationship to existing national codes of conduct • Reference to what constitutes a human rights violation, and the causes and consequences of such violations in the law enforcement and military contexts • References to human rights mechanisms at the international, regional and national levels, including state and non-state actors, especially those with a focus on law enforcement or military operations • References to the rights of law enforcement and military personnel, including redress mechanisms if they feel their rights have been violated • Knowledge of the role of law enforcement and military operations in democratic societies • Knowledge of human rights and applications in the exercise of duty (e.g., use of force; arrest and detention; counter-terrorism operations; investigation; working with refugees and displaced persons, trafficked persons, unaccompanied minors, young people, women and members of minority groups) • Equality and non-discrimination in the exercise of duty • Communication, transparency and accountability related to the wide range of functions of law enforcement and military personnel 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports and plans of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) • Training programs identifying purposes and aspired learner outcomes for training programs

Domain 2: Human Rights Education in the Curriculum

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Are there any national policies that prescribe human rights education within curricula of training institutions for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy; protection of life, liberty and property; protection of constitutional guarantees; freedom from torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment; freedom of expression, association and peaceful demonstration, etc. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • References to learner outcomes reflecting human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes at key training stages 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum frameworks in training institutions
<p>Has a study been carried out to determine the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as learner-centered teaching methodologies within existing training curricula for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its content and pedagogy within curricula? (Y/N)</p> <p>Does the human rights education curriculum include exercises that transform theoretical knowledge into operational, duty-related skills? (Y/N)</p> <p>Are there specific curricula for higher ranking law enforcement and military management?</p>	<p>Sample core and supportive human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • References to knowledge about human rights, such as about one's own rights, the rights of others, key human rights standards and mechanisms and the history of human rights • References to attitudes that reflect human rights values such as equality, non-discrimination, inclusion, participation in society, respect and compassion for others (especially those most vulnerable and marginalized) and justice • References to skills that enable the promotion of human rights, such as the ability to analyze one's environment using a human rights perspective and to work collectively with others to address problems <p>Sample human rights education learner-centered teaching methodology:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participatory methods of instruction • Open discussion • Cooperative learning • Case studies • Simulation techniques and audio-visual materials that reflect real-life situations of law enforcement and military personnel • Interactive problem solving • Presentations from representatives of vulnerable groups and human rights experts <p>Sample knowledge/skills/attitudes for management:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Knowledge/skills/attitudes for formulating human rights-compliant operational procedures • Knowledge/skills/attitudes for carrying out command responsibility and supervision with respect for human rights 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum study • Syllabi for training courses and programs • Reports and plans of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Has a strategy been developed to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within existing training curriculum for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposed integration of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum strategy or related planning document Curriculum strategy report Curriculum requirements Programme monitoring and evaluation data kept by training institutions and relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) Studies on implemented curriculum
Has a strategy been implemented to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within existing training curriculum for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N) Describe.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Integration of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies Time allotted Estimated percentage of learners participating in human rights education 	

Domain 3: Human Rights Education in Training Materials and Methodologies

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Do any guidelines exist for including human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy in the preparation of textbooks and other learning materials for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its content and methodologies within such guidelines? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy, peace, fundamental freedoms, etc. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> General guidelines for the incorporation of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy in a transversal manner across the training program Suggestions for the incorporation of human rights education within specific training topics Content of guidelines is sufficiently clear, accessible and reflects best practice (See Domains 1 and 2 for examples of indicators for human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines issued by relevant ministerial units responsible for training of law enforcement and military personnel (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Has a review been carried out to determine the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as learner-centered teaching methodologies within existing textbooks/learning materials for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Textbook/learning material review (See Domains 1 and 2 for examples of indicators for human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy.) Textbook/learning material review is of high quality (sufficient, rigorous and independent) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Textbook/learning material review report issued by relevant ministerial unit(s) or training institutions (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
<p>Have textbooks/learning materials been removed, revised or newly developed to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within training programs for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p> <p>Have textbooks/learning materials been removed, revised or newly developed to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within training programs for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Learning materials removed Learning materials revised, and revisions are of high quality Learning materials newly developed, and new learning materials are of high quality Removal, revision, or development of learning materials does not weaken the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reports from relevant ministerial unit(s) or training institutions (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Domain 4: Learner Assessments and Program Evaluations in Human Rights Education

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Are learners assessed for achievements in human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Learners' human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes are formally assessed as part of the training program Assessment is of high quality (sufficient, rigorous and independent) Learners' human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes are informally assessed as part of the training program Learners' human rights education-related performances are monitored as part of ongoing performance assessments Managers organize in-service supervision of the human rights practices of staff Accountability mechanisms exist for detecting violations of human rights in the practices of law enforcement and military personnel 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training programs include assessment requirements/ suggestions related to human rights education-related performances Assessment instruments and methods incorporating human rights education-related performance available for use in training programs Learner assessment results kept by training institutions Evaluation instruments and methods incorporating human rights education-related performance available for use in institutions employing law enforcement and military personnel Human rights education-related performance evaluation data kept by institutions employing law enforcement and military personnel Reviews and disciplinary reports of institutions employing law enforcement and military personnel

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Are trainers working with law enforcement and/or military personnel assessed for their human rights education practice and methodologies? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Required by relevant ministries • Elaborated within training institutions for law enforcement and military personnel • Trainer human rights education assessment takes place 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assessment requirements or suggestions associated with trainer performance and human rights education • Instruments and methods used in training programs • Assessment results kept by training institutions
<p>Does monitoring take place in relation to the implementation of human rights education in training programs for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training institutions have mechanisms for ensuring that human rights education is carried out by trainers • Data on human rights education implementation is submitted to relevant government authorities at the district and/or national level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policies and reporting methods for oversight of human rights education within training institutions and programs • Training program reports
<p>Does monitoring take place in relation to the quality of human rights education in training programs for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training institutions keep track of human rights education lesson methodologies and learner outcomes as part of their regular oversight of programming • Data on human rights education quality is submitted to relevant government authorities at the district and/or national level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policies and reporting methods for oversight of human rights education within training institutions and programs • Training program reports
<p>If there is a special government program on human rights education, is it being monitored and evaluated? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formative evaluation of key program components • Summative evaluation • Impact assessment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitoring/status reports • Evaluation reports • Research

Domain 5: Human Rights Education in Trainer Preparation

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Does any national law, policy or education plan require trainers of law enforcement or military personnel to be prepared in human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as learner-centered teaching methodologies? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy; protection of life, liberty and property; protection of constitutional guarantees; freedom from torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment; freedom of expression, association and peaceful demonstration, etc. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<p>(See earlier descriptors for national laws and policies.)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chapter or section on trainer backgrounds contained in white papers, executive orders, rulings or other regulatory instruments of ministries responsible for law enforcement and military personnel Policy papers or guidelines for trainers on human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes
<p>Do the relevant ministries have specific departments or units that prepare law enforcement and military personnel trainers in human rights education? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Separate administrative unit for training trainers in human rights education (possibly combined with non-discrimination, diversity and /or gender sensitivity) Human rights education integrated within existing administrative units or departments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy papers, memos and organizational charts of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
<p>Have the relevant ministries prepared guidelines for trainers and human rights education? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines prepared for training institutions on how to prepare or certify trainers in relation to human rights education Guidelines prepared (directly) for trainers on how to carry out human rights education Content of guidelines is sufficiently clear, accessible and reflects best practice 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines issued by relevant ministerial unit(s) (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
<p>Are human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies present in the curricula of training programs for trainers working with law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes Content on human rights education pedagogy Required or optional Time allotted Number of years offered Number and estimated percentage of trainers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum programs Course syllabi Studies on human rights education competencies of trainers working with law enforcement and military personnel

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Are human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies present in the curricula of higher education (university-based) institutions (initial education)? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes • Content on human rights education pedagogy • Required or optional • Time allotted • Number of years offered • Number of estimated percentage of trainers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum programs • Course syllabi • Studies on human rights education competencies of trainers working with law enforcement and military personnel
<p>Are human rights-related courses, trainings, workshops and other activities for active trainers provided by relevant ministries? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes • Content on human rights education pedagogy • Required or optional • Time allotted • Number of years offered • Number and estimated percentage of active trainers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum programs • Course syllabi • Training agendas • Attendance lists
<p>Are human rights-related courses, trainings, workshops and other activities for active trainers provided by human rights institutions? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes • Content on human rights education pedagogy • Required or optional • Time allotted • Number of years offered • Number and estimated percentage of trainers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum programs • Course syllabi • Training agendas • Attendance lists

HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION AND TRAINING FOR CIVIL SERVANTS, HEALTH WORKERS, SOCIAL WORKERS, JOURNALISTS AND OTHER PROFESSIONALS

In this section, we provide a framework to establish evidence of human rights education and training in the curricula of training institutions for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professional groups and associated supports such as training materials and methodologies, learner assessments, trainer preparation and program monitoring and evaluation for ongoing strengthening and improvement⁷.

Domain 1: Human Rights Education in Legislation and Policy Documents

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Do any national laws or policies prescribe human rights education within training institutions for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy; protection of life, liberty and property; protection of constitutional guarantees; freedom from torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment; freedom of expression, association and peaceful demonstration, etc. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> References to learning about international and regional human rights standards, norms and values, and international humanitarian law (IHL) References to relevant codes of conduct, principles, standards and rules References to the importance of personnel being familiar with their rights and those of community members References to the discharging of professional responsibilities without committing human rights violations References to human rights values such as equality, non-discrimination and service to community members in defining the purposes of professional duties 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legislation - primary and secondary (including national constitution) White papers, executive orders, rulings or other regulatory instruments of ministries responsible for various professions
<p>Are there specific departments or units within the relevant ministries (or at regional/local level if relevant) specializing in human rights education for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Separate unit for human rights education (possibly combined with non-discrimination, diversity and/or gender sensitivity) Human rights education integrated within an existing unit or department 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy papers, memos and organizational charts of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
<p>Is there a specialized government program for human rights education for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Activities (to be) performed Time frame for the program Assignment of responsible person to oversee and guide the program Training personnel and partners who will be involved Allocated budget 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy papers of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) Human rights education program reports

⁷The second phase of the World Programme for Human Rights Education focuses on the training of civil servants, and the third phase focuses on focused on strengthening the implementation of the first two phases and promoting human rights training for media professionals and journalists.

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Has a policy analysis been carried out to see if human rights education-related outcomes are present within the goals and outcomes for the training of civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and members of other professional groups? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its goals, pedagogy and content within the training system(s)? (Y/N)</p>	<p>Sample core human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reference to the “positive” and “negative” obligations of the state and its agents to respect, protect and fulfill human rights • The status of ratification of international and regional human rights treaties • The duties of civil servants and other professional groups as defined in relevant codes of conduct, principles, standards and rules and their relationship to existing national codes of conduct • Reference to what constitutes a human rights violation, and the causes and consequences of such violations in specific professions • References to human rights mechanisms at the international, regional and national levels, including state and non-state actors, especially those with a focus on civil servants, health workers, social workers and other professional groups • References to the rights of civil servants and members of other professional groups, including redress mechanisms if they feel their rights have been violated • Knowledge of the role of civil servants and other professions in democratic societies • Knowledge of human rights and applications in the provision of services to community members • Equality and non-discrimination in the provision of services • Communication, transparency and accountability related to the wide range of functions of civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and members of other professional groups 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Repots and plans of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) • Training programs identifying purposes and aspired learner outcomes for training programs

Domain 2: Human Rights Education in the Curriculum

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Are there any national curriculum policies that prescribe human rights education within curricula for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy; protection of life, liberty and property; protection of constitutional guarantees; freedom from torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment; freedom of expression, association and peaceful demonstration, etc. However, human rights should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • References to learner outcomes reflecting human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes at key training stages 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum frameworks in training institutions
<p>Has a study been carried out to determine the presence of human rights education-related outcomes and learner-centered teaching methodologies within existing training curricula for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its content and pedagogy within curricula? (Y/N)</p> <p>Does the human rights education curriculum include exercises that transform theoretical knowledge into operational, duty-related skills? (Y/N)</p> <p>Are there specific curricula for higher ranking management?</p>	<p>Sample core and supportive human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • References to knowledge about human rights, such as about one's own rights, the rights of others, key human rights standards and mechanisms and the history of human rights • References to attitudes that reflect human rights values such as equality, non-discrimination, inclusion, participation in society, respect and compassion for others (especially those most vulnerable and marginalized) and justice • References to skills that enable the promotion of human rights, such as the ability to analyze one's environment using a human rights perspective and to work collectively with others to address problem <p>Sample human rights education learner-centered teaching methodology:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participatory methods of instruction • Open discussion • Cooperative learning • Case studies • Simulation techniques and audio-visual materials that reflect real-life situation of professionals • Interactive problem solving • Presentations from representatives of vulnerable and marginalized groups and human rights experts <p>Sample knowledge/skills/attitudes for management:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Knowledge/skills/attitudes for formulating human rights-compliant operational procedures • Knowledge/skills/attitudes for carrying out command responsibility and supervision with respect for human rights 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum study • Syllabi for training courses and programs • Reports and plans of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Has a strategy been developed to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within existing training curricula for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposed integration of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriculum strategy or related planning document Curriculum strategy report Curriculum requirements Program monitoring and evaluation data kept by training institutions and relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate) Studies on implemented curriculum
Has a strategy been implemented to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within existing training curriculum for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N) Describe.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Integration of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies Time allotted Estimated percentage of learners participating in human rights education 	

Domain 3: Human Rights Education in Training Materials and Methodologies

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Do any guidelines exist for including human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy in the preparation of textbooks and other learning materials for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)</p> <p>Has human rights education been clearly defined in terms of its content and methodologies within such guidelines? (Y/N)</p> <p><i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy, peace, fundamental freedoms, etc. However, human rights should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> General guidelines for the incorporation of human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy in a transversal manner across the training program Suggestions for the incorporation of human rights education within specific training topics Content of guidelines is sufficiently clear, accessible and reflects best practice (See Domains 1 and 2 for examples of indicators for human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines issued by relevant ministerial units responsible for training of civil servants, health workers, social workers and other professions (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Has a review been carried out to determine the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as learner-centered teaching methodologies within existing textbooks/learning materials for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Textbook/learning material review • (See Domains 1 and 2 for examples of indicators for human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy.) • Textbook/learning material review is of high quality (sufficient, rigorous and independent) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Textbook/learning material review report issued by relevant ministerial unit(s) or training institutions (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
<p>Have textbooks/learning materials been removed, revised or newly developed to strengthen the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within training programs for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p> <p>Have textbooks/learning materials been removed, revised or newly developed to weaken the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as pedagogy within training programs for law enforcement and/or military personnel? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Learning materials removed • Learning materials revised, and revisions are of high quality • Learning materials newly developed, and new learning materials are of high quality • Removal, revision, or development of learning materials does not weaken the presence of human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports from relevant ministerial unit(s) or training institutions (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Domain 4: Learner Assessments and Program Evaluations in Human Rights Education

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
<p>Are learners assessed for achievements in human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Learners' human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes are formally assessed as part of the training program • Assessment is of high quality (sufficient, rigorous and independent) • Learners' human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes are informally assessed as part of the training program • Learners' human rights education-related performances are monitored as part of ongoing performance assessments • Managers organize in-service supervision of the human rights practices of staff • Accountability mechanisms exist for detecting violations of human rights in the practices of civil servants, health workers, social workers and members of other professional groups 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training programs include assessment requirements/suggestions related to human rights education-related performances • Assessment instruments and methods incorporating human rights education-related performance available for use in training programs • Learner assessment results kept by training institutions • Evaluation instruments and methods incorporating human rights education-related performance available for use in institutions employing civil servants and other professional groups human rights education-related performance evaluation data kept by institutions employing civil servants and other professional groups • Reviews and disciplinary reports of institutions employing civil servants and other professional groups
<p>Are trainers working with civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions assessed for their human rights education practice and methods? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Required by relevant ministries • Elaborated within training institutions for civil servants, health workers, social workers and other professions • Trainer human rights education assessment takes place 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assessment requirements or suggestions associated with trainer performance and human rights education • Instruments and methods used in training programs • Assessment results kept by training institutions
<p>Does monitoring take place in relation to the implementation of human rights education in training programs for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training institutions have mechanisms for ensuring that human rights education is carried out by trainers • Data on human rights education implementation is submitted to relevant government authorities at the district and/or national level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policies and reporting methods for oversight of human rights education within training institutions and programs • Training program reports

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Does monitoring take place in relation to the quality of human rights education in training programs for civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training institutions keep track of human rights education lesson methodologies and learner outcomes as part of their regular oversight of programming • Data on human rights education quality is submitted to relevant government authorities at the district and/or national level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policies and reporting methods for oversight of human rights education within training institutions and programs • Training program reports
Is there is a special government program on human rights education, is it being monitored and evaluated? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formative evaluation of key program components • Summative evaluation • Impact assessment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitoring/status reports • Evaluation reports • Research

Domain 5: Human Rights Education in Trainer Preparation

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Does any national law, policy or education plan require trainers of civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions groups to be prepared in human rights education-related knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as learner-centered teaching methodologies? (Y/N) <i>(Note: Reference to human rights may be presented in conjunction with other themes such as democracy; protection of life, liberty and property; protection of constitutional guarantees; freedom from torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment; freedom of expression, association and peaceful demonstration, etc. However, 'human rights' should be distinctly mentioned to be considered an indicator of human rights education.)</i>	(See earlier descriptors for national laws and policies.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chapter or section on trainer backgrounds contained in white papers, executive orders, rulings or other regulatory instruments of ministries responsible for civil servants and other professional groups • Policy papers or guidelines for trainers on human rights knowledge/skills/attitudes
Are human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies present in the curricula of higher education (university-based) institutions (initial education)? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Separate administrative unit for training trainers in human rights education (possibly combined with non-discrimination, diversity and /or gender sensitivity) • Human rights education integrated within existing administrative units or departments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policy papers, memos and organizational charts of relevant ministries (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)

Key Monitoring Questions/Indicators	Descriptors/Sub-Indicators	Sources of Information
Have the relevant ministries prepared guidelines for trainers and human rights education? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guidelines prepared for training institutions on how to prepare or certify trainers in relation to human rights education • Guidelines prepared (directly) for trainers on how to carry out human rights education • Content of guidelines is sufficiently clear, accessible and reflects best practice 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guidelines issued by relevant ministerial unit(s) (and regional/local authorities, where appropriate)
Are human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies present in the curricula of training programs for preparing trainers working with civil servants, health workers, social workers, journalists and other professions? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes • Content on human rights education pedagogy • Required or optional • Time allotted • Number of years offered • Number and estimated percentage of trainers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum programs • Course syllabi • Studies on human rights education competencies of trainers working with civil servants and other professional groups
Are human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy present in the curricula of higher education (university-based) institutions (initial education)? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes • Content on human rights education pedagogy • Required or optional • Time allotted • Number of years offered • Number of estimated percentage of trainers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum programs • Course syllabi • Research papers, theses and essays produced by faculty and students on human rights education-related to civil servants and other professions
Do relevant ministries provide human rights-related courses, trainings, workshops or other activities for active trainers? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes • Content on human rights education pedagogy • Required or optional • Time allotted • Number of years offered • Number and estimated percentage of active trainers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum programs • Course syllabi • Training agendas • Attendance lists
Are human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and pedagogy present in the curricula of higher education (university-based) institutions (initial education)? (Y/N)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Content related to human rights education knowledge/skills/attitudes • Content on human rights education pedagogy • Required or optional • Time allotted • Number of years offered • Number and estimated percentage of trainers participating in human rights education-related training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum programs • Course syllabi • Training agendas • Attendance lists

